HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

2 STATE HOUSE STATION
AUGUSTA, MAINE 04333-0002
(207) 287-1440
MAINE RELAY 711

Gregory Lewis Swallow
P.O. Box 742
Houlton, ME 04730
Gregory.Swallow@legislature.maine.gov
Cell: (207) 521-7416

Senator Grohoski, Representative Cloutier and members of the Taxation Committee, I am Representative Gregory Swallow from House District 7 representing Houlton, Linneus, Ludlow, New Limerick and Oakfield. I am here today to introduce LD 1853. This bill allows education dollars to follow the child by allowing the parent(s) to select the school of their choice and pay the school with refundable tuition tax credit dollars which may be further supplemented with their private funds. It allows for refundable tuition tax credits in the amount of 70% of the per pupil average expenditures spent on traditional Maine public school students in the school year two years prior to be used toward tuition and fees at a private school.

In the report, The Learning State: Maine Schooling for the 21st Century **published by the Maine Department of Education –** Executive Summary states: "Maine's schools are not ready for the 21st century." In order for Maine to flourish it states dramatic change must occur in Maine's schools. (p.6) Maine has one of the most expensive public school systems in the nation and yet our results measured by multiple indices are flat through recent years (p, 8). *This original report was published around 1997 and the results are no longer flat but declining.* The report then goes on to recommend expanding the current opportunities for school choice. What has the legislative response been to expanding school choice? Greater public school consolidation and a state versus parent battle to not allow state school funding dollars to flow to sectarian schools.

Issues Surrounding American public education and school choice.

What is the comparative per pupil public school costs between Maine, other states and internationally?

National Center for Education Statistics (NCES), the statistical division of the U. S. Department of Education, tables show American public schools spent $16,808 per pupil in the 2019-2020 school year as measured in constant inflation adjusted 2022-2023 dollars and by 2020-2021 U. S public elementary and secondary school expenditures totaled $17,495 per pupil. In fact, these expenditures in the decade from 2010-11 to 2020-21 increased 13 percent on a per pupil basis after adjusting for inflation.

Furthermore, the cost of U. S. per pupil public school expenditures has increased substantially in real dollars over the past several decades. Between the **1969-1970 and 2019-2020 school years** per pupil expenditures in U. S. public elementary and secondary schools increased in constant 2022-2023 inflation adjusted dollars from $6,474 to $16,808. This is a 160% increase after adjusting for inflation and the differential has grown since that time. As an aside, the Cato Institute estimated that all the public school expenditures are not being reported and the public schools they reviewed were under reporting the costs due to exclusion of capital expenditures and various other expenditures.

When U. S. per pupil spending is compared with other countries, the U. S. over recent years has generally placed between third (3) and fifth (5) in per pupil expenditures when compared with OECD (Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development) and other nations. The most recent 2019 comparisons show the U. S. spent more per pupil than all countries except Austria, Luxembourg, Norway and South Korea. All much smaller countries. Additionally, in 2019 the average per pupil expenditure for OECD nations in constant 2021 U. S. dollars was $11,300 compared to the U. S. with $15,500 per pupil. The U. S. per pupil expenditures were 38% higher than the average for all OECD nations.

According to the National Center for Education Statistics, the current per pupil expenditure for grades K-12 for Maine students in the **2019-2020 school year** was $20,726 in constant 2022-2023 inflation adjusted dollars, 14th highest state in the nation and 10th highest by 2020-2021 school year. The comparable current national average per pupil expenditure was, as mentioned above, $16,808 in 2020. Therefore, Maine stood 23.5% above the national average in per pupil costs in the 2019-2020 school year. Since 2020 the gap in spending on elementary and secondary education between Maine and the national average has widened. On a nationwide basis per pupil expenditures increased from 2020 to 2021 by 4.1% while Maine's per pupil expenditures increased by 11.8%.

If Maine were a country, it would rank second in the world for per pupil expenditures on K–12 education. Maine's per pupil public school expenditures for elementary and secondary education in constant inflation adjusted 2022-2023 dollars has increased 64% from 1990($12,681) to 2020 ($20,726) and 83% from 1990 ($12,681) to 2021 ($23,164). In 1990, Maine's expenditures were only 7.8% above the national average as compared to 23.5% in 2019-2020; however, for all this increased spending results have waned as is illustrated below. .

For all that the U. S. spends on our public education system, what are the results?

PISA Tests (International)

The best comparison between U. S. students and those of other countries for educational outcomes is the Program for International Student Assessment (PISA) tests. PISA testing is performed every three years and tests students for proficiency in reading, math and science. Pisa tests have weathered eight cycles since the inception in 2000. PISA tests competency in these subject areas between 15-year-olds from OECD nations and other participating countries. Below are results of PISA testing from the years 2009 to 2022.

Subject	**U. S.**	**OECD Average**	**U. S Ranking**
Year	**2022/2018/2012/2009**	**2022/2018/2012/2009**	**2022/2018/2012/2009**
Reading	504/ 505/ 498/ 500	501/ 487/ 496/ 493	9 13 24 10
Math	465/ 478/ 481/ 487	472/ 489/ 494/ 496	34 35 36 18
Science	499/ 502/ 498/ 502	485/ 489/ 496/ 501	16 18 25 19

These test results have been trending **slightly** to the downside in recent years. Upon considering U. S. per pupil expenditures compared with other nations, the results are extremely disappointing. Overall averages are brought down by more underdeveloped countries. In the 2018 PISA tests, the U. S. was compared to only the 35 OECD countries rather than all participants and ranked 13th. In 2022, the overall rank for U. S students dropped to 18th place among countries. The U. S. students overall PISA score dropped in 2022 to 1,468, down from 1,485 in 2018. NAEP Tests Recent Comparative

TIMMS (International)

The second major international comparative study that compares U. S. student's achievement internationally is the TIMSS tests (Trends in International Mathematics and Science Study). TIMSS tests are administered every four years to fourth and eight grade level students from nations throughout the world, testing achievement in both mathematics and science. TIMSS testing began in 1995 with the most recent study in 2023.

Average U.S. fourth grade and eighth grade scores in math were lower in 2023 than in 2019 (by 18 and 27 points, respectively). Fourth graders math results were 517 in 2023 as compared with 535 in 2019. Eighth graders scores were 488 in 2023 down from 515 in 2019. U.S. fourth grade and eighth math scores in 2023 were the lowest ever recorded since the testing began in 1995. These math scores resulted in a 27th place ranking for fourth graders and a 24th place ranking for eighth graders.

In science, U. S. fourth grade and eighth grade student scores continued to fall. TIMSS science scores for fourth grade was 532 resulting a 12th place ranking. Eighth grade science scores also ranked 12th with a 513 score. Fourth-grade science test scores are the lowest they have ever been and eighth-grade science scores are the same as they were in 1995.

NAEP (National)

The National Association of Educational Progress (NAEP) tests further illustrate a proficiency divide in math and reading between public school and private school students. The chart below shows the 2022 results between public, charter and private Catholic schools in math and reading at three grade levels. Many charter schools are set up for special needs which affects their score. Later in this testimony it will show apples to apples comparisons between charter and public schools.

Grade	Public (Math/Reading)	Charter (Math/Reading)	Private Catholic (Math/Reading)
Four	235/216	232/214	246/233
Eighth	273/259	286/257	288/279
Twelve	149/284	138/275	N/A

On a nationwide basis white and Asian students comprise a majority of students in public schools, at the same time black and Hispanic students make up the majority of students in charter schools and are often located in low-income minority neighborhoods.

NAEP Tests Maine & Nationally

The National Assessment of Education Progress (NAEP) tests students for grade level proficiency in math and reading. Below is a chart outlining the results for the NAEP's 2024 and prior years Nations Report Card.

Grade	Reading Proficiency (Maine/National Score)					Math Proficiency (Maine/National Score)				
Year	*Maine*	*2024*	*2019*	*2003*	*1992*	*Maine*	*2024*	*2019*	*2003*	*1992*
Four	26%	(210/214)	(221/219)	(224/216)	(228/216)	33%	(233/237)	(241/240)	(238/234)	(232/217)
Eight	26%	(255/257)	(265/263)	(268/261)	(* /266)	25%	(273/272)	(282/281)	(282/276)	(279/266)

In 1992, Maine fourth graders achieved the #1 ranking in math and #2 ranking in reading.

In 2024, Maine fourth graders ranked #43 in math and #43 in reading.

In 1992, Maine eighth graders ranked #4 in math and first took the reading test in 1998*, ranking #1.

In 2024, Maine eighth graders ranked #27 in math and #34 in reading.

The Nations Report Card confirms that approximately 1/3 or less of Maine students are at grade level proficiency in either reading or math. Furthermore, reading scores for grade levels 4 & 8 are below those in 1998 with little change in math scores as well. It's imperative to consider that Maine is well above the national average in per pupil expenditures, has a low student teacher ratio and is relieved from dealing with the issues of large urban schools. Finally, it is my understanding that between 1986 and 2006 Maine's per pupil K-12 education expenditures were the fastest growing of any U.S. state on a percentage basis.

SAT Tests (National)

SAT scores for all U. S. students can be compared historically. The scores have been generally declining over time. NCES table 226.20 shows SAT scores have dropped from 1049 in 1970 (reading 537 – math 512) to 1019 in 2000 (reading 505 – math 514) and 1006 (reading 495 – math 511) in 2015.

In 2021, the average private school SAT score was 1227. In that same year, the average SAT score for all students was 1061 (reading 533 – math 528); however, it has become more difficult to compare historical SAT scores since 2016 when significant changes were made.

The 1983 report "A Nation at Risk" noted that average verbal SAT scores plummeted "over 50 points" and the mathematics SAT scores fell "nearly 40 points" between 1963-1980. We have not been moving up since that report. NAEP testing did not begin until 1990.

NAIS Tests (National)

In a 2014-2015 study published by the National Association of Independent Schools (NAIS) a comparative analysis illustrates the contrast between the public school and private school students with SAT scores in reading and math.

Entity	Reading (White/Black/Asian)	(2015-16 All)	Math (White/Black/Asian)	(2015-16 All)
NAIS SAT	600/545/578	588	598/537/657	602
National SAT	529/431/525	494	534/528/596	508

NAEP Test & Per Pupil Spending State Comparisons (National)

The following four pages are comprised of charts comparing all 50 states and the District of Columbia based on the recent **Nations Report Card**. The tests scores are from the 2024 NAEP, National Assessment of Education Progress, test results ranked from highest to lowest by state. These scores are the results for fourth grade reading and fourth grade math which are illustrated under the "Score" heading.

In addition to state rankings by test outcome, an additional column has been added on the far left. This column displays the state's/jurisdiction's spending, ranked from highest to lowest. For example, Massachusetts ranked highest in fourth grade reading results with a score of 225 and was the sixth highest state in per pupil expenditures. Utah scored seventh in NAEP test results for fourth grade reading while being fiftieth in per pupil expenditures. The purpose of this chart is to allow comparisons of state spending per pupil to NAEP test results. Similarly, one can compare this data with other factors including a comparative analysis of rural state costs and results to those of more urbanized states. It is worth noting that the very urban District of Columbia ranks first in per pupil expenditures while scoring 45th in grade four reading results. Furthermore, of the top ten ranked states in fourth grade reading results only three are ranked in the top ten for spending. The eight pages of charts follow.

Grade 4 Reading Pg. 1

Click on column headers to sort data by scores for a student group or score differences

CHANGE TABLE FORMAT OPTIONS

Spending Rank '21	JURISDICTION	AVERAGE SCORE (0 - 500)		ACHIEVEMENT LEVEL PERCENTAGES	
		Score	Difference from National public (NP)	At or above Basic	At or above Proficient
	DoDEA	234	20	79	48
6	Massachusetts	225	11	68	40
11	Wyoming	222	8	68	36
4	New Jersey	222	7	66	38
13	New Hampshire	221	7	67	36
27	Colorado	221	7	65	36
37	Indiana	220	6	65	34
50	Utah	219	5	64	36
5	Connecticut	219	5	63	36
45	Mississippi	219	4	65	32
44	Florida	218	4	62	33
34	Kentucky	218	4	62	33
32	Montana	217	3	62	32
8	Rhode Island	216	2	61	33
24	Ohio	216	2	62	32
31	Louisiana	216	2	60	32
15	Hawaii	216	2	61	32
12	Pennsylvania	216	1	62	33
16	Washington	216	1	61	32
51	Idaho	216	1	61	32
14	Maryland	216	1	59	34
18	North Dakota	216	1	62	29
22	Wisconsin	215	1	61	31
47	Tennessee	215	1	61	32
35	South Carolina	215	1	60	32
2	New York	215	#	59	31
30	Iowa	215	#	61	29
20	Minnesota	214	#	61	31

Grade 4 Reading P82

Spending Rank '21	JURISDICTION	AVERAGE SCORE (0 - 500) Score	Difference from National public (NP)	ACHIEVEMENT LEVEL PERCENTAGES At or above Basic	At or above Proficient
36	Georgia	214	#	59	30
	National public	214	†	59	30
9	Illinois	214	#	59	30
26	Virginia	214	#	58	31
39	South Dakota	214	#	60	28
42	North Carolina	213	-1	58	30
43	Alabama	213	-1	58	28
46	Nevada	213	-1	59	30
28	Kansas	213	-1	60	28
3	Vermont	213	-2	58	31
40	Texas	212	-2	57	28
33	Missouri	212	-2	58	27
23	California	212	-3	56	29
21	Nebraska	212	-3	58	28
38	Arkansas	210	-5	56	28
10	Maine	210	-5	56	26
17	Delaware	210	-5	55	26
1	District of Columbia	209	-5	52	30
25	Michigan	209	-5	55	25
48	Arizona	208	-6	53	26
49	Oklahoma	207	-7	54	23
19	Oregon	207	-7	52	27
29	West Virginia	206	-8	53	25
7	Alaska	202	-13	47	22
41	New Mexico	201	-14	47	20
	Puerto Rico	—	†	—	—

Significantly higher than National public

Not significantly different from National public

Significantly lower than National public

Show Notes & Sources

Grade 4 Math pg 1

Click on column headers to sort data by scores for a student group or score differences

CHANGE TABLE FORMAT OPTIONS

Spending Rank '21	JURISDICTION	AVERAGE SCORE (0 - 500)		ACHIEVEMENT LEVEL PERCENTAGES	
		Score	Difference from National public (NP)	At or above Basic	At or above Proficient
	DoDEA	251	13	91	54
6	Massachusetts	246	9	82	51
44	Florida	243	6	82	45
11	Wyoming	243	6	83	46
13	New Hampshire	242	4	81	43
50	Utah	242	4	79	45
18	North Dakota	241	4	81	43
20	Minnesota	241	3	78	45
40	Texas	241	3	79	43
37	Indiana	240	3	79	43
4	New Jersey	240	3	77	44
39	South Dakota	240	3	79	42
47	Tennessee	240	2	78	42
24	Ohio	239	2	77	43
15	Hawaii	239	2	77	42
22	Wisconsin	239	2	77	42
45	Mississippi	239	2	81	38
27	Colorado	239	2	77	42
5	Connecticut	239	2	76	42
42	North Carolina	239	2	77	41
32	Montana	238	1	78	40
51	Idaho	238	1	76	41
21	Nebraska	238	1	78	40
12	Pennsylvania	238	1	75	41
26	Virginia	238	1	76	40
34	Kentucky	238	1	78	38
35	South Carolina	238	#	76	40
16	Washington	238	#	75	40

Grade 4 Math pg 2

Spending Rank '21	JURISDICTION	AVERAGE SCORE (0 - 500) Score	Difference from National public (NP)	ACHIEVEMENT LEVEL PERCENTAGES At or above Basic	At or above Proficient
	National public	237	†	76	39
8	Rhode Island	237	#	76	38
28	Kansas	237	#	76	40
30	Iowa	237	#	77	39
43	Alabama	236	-1	76	37
36	Georgia	236	-1	75	38
9	Illinois	236	-1	74	38
25	Michigan	235	-2	74	37
33	Missouri	235	-2	75	36
3	Vermont	235	-2	75	36
31	Louisiana	235	-3	75	35
2	New York	234	-3	72	37
14	Maryland	234	-3	70	37
46	Nevada	233	-4	72	36
17	Delaware	233	-4	71	35
10	Maine	233	-4	73	33
23	California	233	-4	70	35
49	Oklahoma	233	-5	74	31
48	Arizona	232	-5	70	34
29	West Virginia	232	-6	72	31
1	District of Columbia	231	-7	65	33
38	Arkansas	230	-7	70	31
19	Oregon	229	-9	67	31
7	Alaska	226	-11	64	30
41	New Mexico	224	-13	62	23
	Puerto Rico	184	-53	18	2

Significantly higher than National public | Not significantly different from National public | Significantly lower than National public

Show Notes & Sources

Grade 8 Reading Pg. 1

percentage at or above Proficient, between all jurisdictions and National public, for All students [TOTAL], 2024

Click on column headers to sort data by scores for a student group or score differences

CHANGE TABLE FORMAT OPTIONS

JURISDICTION	AVERAGE SCORE (0 - 500)		ACHIEVEMENT LEVEL PERCENTAGES	
	Score	Difference from National public (NP)	At or above Basic	At or above Proficient
DoDEA	282	25	90	53
Massachusetts	268	11	75	40
New Jersey	266	9	73	38
Colorado	265	8	74	35
New Hampshire	264	7	74	34
Connecticut	263	6	70	35
Indiana	262	5	69	33
Illinois	262	5	70	33
Utah	261	5	72	31
Idaho	261	4	71	32
Iowa	261	4	72	31
Montana	261	4	70	31
Ohio	260	4	69	32
Wisconsin	260	3	70	31
Minnesota	260	3	71	28
Wyoming	260	3	70	29
South Dakota	260	3	70	29
Georgia	259	3	68	31
Washington	259	3	69	31
Pennsylvania	259	2	69	31
Tennessee	259	2	68	31
Maryland	258	2	66	33
Kentucky	258	1	67	29
Rhode Island	258	1	66	30
North Dakota	257	1	68	25

JURISDICTION	AVERAGE SCORE (0 - 500)		ACHIEVEMENT LEVEL PERCENTAGES	
	Score	Difference from National public (NP)	At or above Basic	At or above Proficient
Hawaii	257	1	67	29
Vermont	257	1	67	29
New York	257	#	65	31
National public	257	†	66	29
Louisiana	257	#	66	27
Virginia	256	#	66	29
Nebraska	256	-1	67	27
Kansas	255	-1	66	25
Missouri	255	-1	65	26
Michigan	255	-2	65	24
Maine	255	-2	65	26
North Carolina	255	-2	65	27
Oregon	255	-2	65	27
Arkansas	255	-2	65	25
California	254	-2	63	28
Arizona	254	-2	65	25
South Carolina	254	-3	64	26
Mississippi	253	-3	64	23
Nevada	253	-3	62	26
Florida	253	-4	63	25
Texas	252	-4	61	25
District of Columbia	251	-5	58	25
Alabama	250	-7	59	21
Delaware	249	-7	59	23
Oklahoma	249	-8	59	20
West Virginia	247	-9	58	21
Alaska	246	-10	57	22
New Mexico	245	-12	54	19
Puerto Rico	—	†	—	—

Grade 8 Math pg. 1

percentage at or above Proficient, between all jurisdictions and National public, for All students [TOTAL], 2024

Click on column headers to sort data by scores for a student group or score differences

CHANGE TABLE FORMAT OPTIONS

JURISDICTION	AVERAGE SCORE (0 - 500)		ACHIEVEMENT LEVEL PERCENTAGES	
	Score	Difference from National public (NP)	At or above Basic	At or above Proficient
DoDEA	291	19	81	41
Massachusetts	283	11	68	37
Wisconsin	283	10	69	37
Minnesota	282	10	71	34
Utah	282	10	70	35
New Jersey	282	9	65	37
South Dakota	281	9	71	33
Nebraska	280	8	69	32
North Dakota	280	8	71	29
New Hampshire	280	8	69	32
Montana	279	7	68	32
Ohio	279	7	65	32
Wyoming	278	6	68	30
Indiana	278	6	67	31
Colorado	278	6	65	32
Idaho	278	6	67	31
Illinois	277	5	62	32
Connecticut	277	4	63	32
Pennsylvania	276	4	63	31
Tennessee	276	4	62	31
North Carolina	276	4	62	31
Vermont	276	3	64	29
Virginia	275	3	63	29
Iowa	275	3	65	27
Kansas	274	2	63	26

JURISDICTION	AVERAGE SCORE (0 - 500)		ACHIEVEMENT LEVEL PERCENTAGES	
	Score	Difference from National public (NP)	At or above Basic	At or above Proficient
Washington	274	1	59	30
Maine	273	#	61	25
National public	272	†	59	27
New York	271	-1	58	26
Kentucky	271	-1	58	24
Missouri	270	-2	59	23
Hawaii	270	-2	58	23
Michigan	270	-2	57	24
Rhode Island	270	-2	57	26
Arizona	270	-3	57	26
Texas	269	-3	56	24
Mississippi	269	-3	57	22
California	269	-3	54	25
Georgia	269	-4	56	24
Maryland	268	-4	54	25
South Carolina	268	-4	55	24
Oregon	268	-4	55	24
Florida	267	-5	55	21
Louisiana	267	-5	54	21
Arkansas	266	-6	54	20
Nevada	265	-7	52	20
Oklahoma	264	-8	53	17
Alaska	264	-8	54	22
Delaware	263	-9	51	19
Alabama	262	-10	50	18
District of Columbia	262	-11	46	20
West Virginia	261	-11	48	18
New Mexico	256	-16	42	14
Puerto Rico	216	-56	5	#

The primary experiential study performed to date between private charter and public schools is chronicled in Dr. Thomas Sowell's book, **Charter Schools and Their Enemies,** copyright 2020. In this 2017-2018 study, very specific parameters are established to ensure that the results are based upon true empirical analysis and to remove subjectivity. This study is limited to public and charter schools in New York City only. The following is a list of criteria established by Dr. Sowell to maintain the principle of impartiality and abolish any "cherry picking" and maintain objectivity in comparing charter and public schools.

- There is a similar ethnic composition of students from the charter school and the traditional public school being compared and the schools must serve the same local population.
- The students in both schools are taught in the very same building. This assists in reducing any dispersions due to location of homes and socioeconomic backgrounds.
- The traditional public school and the charter school have one or more classes in the same building at the same grade level for test comparison purposes.
- The students are selected by lottery

Particular detailed study was given to five of the largest charter schools in New York City with networks of multiple schools with students in five or more building that are shared with traditional public schools and having students at the same grade level. Also, the schools that are compared in this sample must have a majority of students who are either black and/or Hispanic.

In the end, the study concentrated on five charter school networks that met the above requirements; however, results from smaller charter school are also included in the results. It's important to note that these students are from the same neighborhood, have the same ethnic and socio-economic backgrounds and are selected by lottery only. The two tests utilized are given annually by the New York State Education Department and basically deal with reading/English and math comprehension.

The study allows for comparing charter schools among one another as well as public schools. The results show widely contrasting differences between charter schools and public schools with particular charter schools exhibiting astoundingly different outcomes and consistently so.

Exhibits- Percent at/above proficient in English Language Arts testing shown on the following pages:

Pg. 141 - Achievement First Charter School vs. Alejandrina Gautier School – Grade 3; **64% vs. 19%**

Pg. 141 - Achievement First Charter School vs. Alejandrina Gautier School – Grade 4; **78% vs. 20%**

Pg. 141 - Achievement First Charter School vs. Ernest S. Jenkins School – Grade 5; **59% vs. 5%**

Pg. 176 – Success Academy Charter School vs. PS 138 Brooklyn – Grade 6; **96% vs. 39%**

Pg. 177 – Success Academy Charter School vs. William Floyd – Grade 3; **93% vs. 33%**

Pg. 182 – Uncommon Schools Charter School vs. Eagle Academy for Young Men – Grade 6; **57% vs. 18%**

Pg. 183 – Uncommon Schools Charter School vs. George Wibecan Pre. Academy – Grade 3; **80% vs. 21%**

Of the 65 charter schools in New York City that were in the same building as the public schools there were 172 grade levels tested in English Language Arts. The majority of charter school students scored proficient or above in 65% of those grade levels. The public school students only had a majority of students scoring at or above proficiency in 14 percent of those grade levels with 191 grade levels tested.

Exhibits- Percent at/above proficient in Math testing shown on the following pages:

Pg. 168 – Kipp Charter School vs. New Design Middle School – Grade 8; **84% vs. 15%**

Pg. 169 – Kipp Charter School vs. Lou Gehrig School – Grade 7; **74% vs. 5%**

Pg. 173 – South Bronx Classic Charter School vs. Jonathan D. Hyatt – Grade 3; **100% vs. 56%**

Pg. 173 – South Bronx Classic Charter School vs. Entrada Academy – Grade 7; **93% vs. 4%**

Pg. 178 – Success Academy Charter School vs. Benjamin Franklin School – Grade 4; **99% vs. 27%**

Pg. 179 – Success Academy Charter School vs. Frederick Douglas Academy – Grade 6; **100% vs. 20%**

Pg. 179 – Success Academy Charter School vs. Mahalia Jackson School – Grade 3; **100% vs. 13%**

On the New York State math test 68% of the charter schools with 161 grade levels tested had a majority of students testing at or above proficiency. The traditional public schools had 177 grade levels tested. Only 10% of the public schools had a majority of students scoring at or above proficient at those grade levels.

Again, these students are from the same neighborhood, have the same ethnic make-up, background, selected by lottery and taught in the same school building.

Table 236.70. Current expenditures per pupil in average daily attendance in public elementary and secondary schools, by state or jurisdiction: Selected school years, 1969-70 through 2020-21

	Unadjusted dollars[1]															Constant 2022-23 dollars[2]											
State or jurisdiction	1969-70	1979-80	1989-90	1999-2000	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19	2019-20[3]	2020-21[3]	1969-70	1979-80	1989-90	1999-2000	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19	2019-20[3]	2020-21[3]
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26	27	28	29	30	31
United States	$816	$2,272	$4,980	$7,394	$11,433	$11,362	$11,509	$11,819	$12,224	$12,619	$13,096	$13,545	$14,165	$14,427	$15,362	$6,474	$8,770	$11,753	$13,088	$15,498	$14,963	$14,909	$15,075	$15,479	$15,871	$16,174	$16,360	$16,761	$16,808	$17,495
Alabama	544	1,612	3,327	5,758	9,296	8,927	9,486	9,543	9,690	9,870	10,161	10,374	10,846	10,893	11,330	4,316	6,222	7,853	10,194	12,601	11,756	12,288	12,172	12,270	12,414	12,549	12,529	12,833	12,691	12,903
Alaska	1,123	4,728	8,431	9,668	18,352	19,134	19,982	20,254	22,161	19,242	19,550	19,498	20,088	20,195	21,495	8,906	18,250	19,899	17,115	24,876	25,198	25,885	25,833	28,060	24,201	24,145	23,550	23,770	23,528	24,479
Arizona	720	1,971	4,053	5,478	8,646	8,224	8,388	8,278	8,426	8,572	8,867	9,057	9,650	9,628	10,856	5,713	7,608	9,566	9,698	11,719	10,831	10,865	10,559	10,669	10,781	10,951	10,940	11,418	11,217	12,363
Arkansas	568	1,574	3,485	5,628	10,332	10,397	9,853	10,622	10,756	10,837	10,968	11,226	11,458	11,257	12,257	4,503	6,078	8,225	9,963	14,005	13,691	12,763	13,548	13,620	13,630	13,546	13,558	13,558	13,115	13,959
California	867	2,268	4,391	6,401	9,540	9,608	9,686	10,094	10,924	11,937	12,730	13,263	14,588	14,466	15,084	6,880	8,754	10,363	11,330	12,932	12,653	12,547	12,874	13,832	15,014	15,722	16,019	17,262	16,853	17,178
Colorado	738	2,421	4,720	6,702	9,709	9,415	9,572	9,924	10,349	10,619	10,946	11,304	12,465	13,087	14,340	5,854	9,345	11,141	11,864	13,161	12,399	12,400	12,657	13,104	13,356	13,518	13,653	14,749	15,247	16,331
Connecticut	951	2,420	7,837	10,122	16,932	17,472	17,859	19,029	19,731	20,380	20,731	20,964	21,964	21,693	23,380	7,547	9,342	14,497	17,918	22,951	23,010	23,134	24,270	24,984	25,632	25,603	25,320	25,990	25,274	26,626
Delaware	900	2,861	5,799	8,809	13,228	14,253	14,129	14,203	14,556	15,150	15,824	16,292	16,595	17,563	16,322	7,141	11,045	13,686	15,593	17,931	18,770	18,302	18,115	18,431	19,055	19,543	19,678	19,636	20,462	18,588
District of Columbia	1,018	3,259	8,955	11,935	21,304	20,399	20,333	21,629	21,362	22,340	23,632	25,381	25,674	26,050	28,678	8,079	12,581	21,135	21,127	28,877	26,864	26,339	27,586	27,048	28,098	29,186	30,655	30,379	30,349	32,659
Florida	732	1,889	4,997	6,383	9,394	8,825	8,925	9,189	9,295	9,337	9,571	10,072	10,184	10,660	11,163	5,810	7,292	11,795	11,299	12,733	11,622	11,562	11,720	11,770	11,744	11,820	12,165	12,051	12,420	12,713
Georgia	588	1,625	4,275	6,903	9,577	9,492	9,437	9,529	9,809	10,185	10,722	11,259	11,635	12,026	12,874	4,664	6,274	10,089	12,220	12,982	12,500	12,224	12,154	12,420	12,810	13,242	13,598	13,767	14,011	14,661
Hawaii	841	2,322	4,448	7,090	12,603	12,735	12,585	13,219	13,849	14,728	15,325	16,237	17,269	17,736	18,148	6,668	8,963	10,499	12,551	17,083	16,772	16,302	16,860	17,535	18,523	18,926	19,611	20,434	20,664	20,668
Idaho	603	1,659	3,078	5,644	7,155	7,041	7,273	7,215	7,409	7,642	8,024	8,359	8,726	8,838	9,172	4,786	6,405	7,264	9,991	9,699	9,273	9,421	9,202	9,381	9,612	9,909	10,096	10,326	10,296	10,445
Illinois	909	2,587	5,118	8,084	13,180	13,459	13,808	14,682	15,473	15,909	17,332	17,693	18,208	19,058	20,755	7,215	9,985	12,079	14,310	17,866	17,725	17,887	18,726	19,592	20,009	21,405	21,369	21,545	22,203	23,637
Indiana	728	1,882	4,606	7,652	9,924	10,220	10,037	10,078	10,202	10,368	10,472	10,758	11,028	11,516	12,868	5,776	7,267	10,872	13,546	13,452	13,459	13,001	12,854	12,918	13,040	12,933	12,994	13,049	13,417	14,654
Iowa	844	2,326	4,453	6,925	10,565	10,748	10,915	11,359	11,698	11,846	12,167	12,596	12,907	13,255	14,236	6,697	8,981	10,509	12,259	14,321	14,154	14,139	14,487	14,812	14,899	15,026	15,213	15,272	15,443	16,213
Kansas	771	2,173	4,752	6,962	10,700	10,712	10,789	11,180	11,106	10,815	11,159	12,003	12,295	12,844	14,281	6,117	8,388	11,215	12,325	14,504	14,107	13,976	14,260	14,062	13,603	13,782	14,497	14,548	14,964	16,263
Kentucky	545	1,701	3,745	6,784	10,469	10,700	10,269	10,248	10,659	10,912	11,193	12,574	12,784	13,284	13,369	4,325	6,567	8,839	12,010	14,191	14,092	13,302	13,071	13,496	13,724	13,824	15,187	15,127	15,476	15,225
Louisiana	648	1,792	3,903	6,256	11,500	11,352	11,118	11,415	11,697	11,775	12,050	12,354	12,512	12,384	14,182	5,141	6,918	9,213	11,074	15,588	14,949	14,402	14,559	14,811	14,810	14,882	14,922	14,806	14,428	16,151
Maine	692	1,824	5,373	8,247	14,406	14,000	14,347	14,926	15,839	16,060	16,103	16,655	17,419	17,790	20,340	5,494	7,039	12,681	14,599	19,527	18,438	18,584	19,038	20,055	20,200	19,887	20,116	20,612	20,726	23,164
Maryland	918	2,598	6,275	8,273	14,876	14,746	15,010	15,109	15,403	15,478	15,982	16,452	16,932	17,218	18,512	7,285	10,029	14,811	14,645	20,165	19,419	19,444	19,271	19,504	19,467	19,739	19,871	20,036	20,060	21,082
Massachusetts	859	2,819	6,237	9,375	15,334	15,607	16,111	16,646	17,311	18,026	18,852	19,409	20,299	20,852	22,875	6,815	10,883	14,721	16,596	20,785	20,554	20,869	21,231	21,919	22,672	23,284	23,442	24,019	24,293	26,050
Michigan	904	2,640	5,546	8,886	11,560	11,462	11,495	11,678	12,048	12,243	12,448	12,895	13,315	13,621	14,699	7,171	10,192	13,091	15,730	15,670	15,094	14,890	14,894	15,256	15,399	15,374	15,574	15,755	15,869	16,740
Minnesota	904	2,387	4,971	7,499	11,368	11,424	11,754	12,140	12,707	13,169	13,496	13,834	14,250	14,440	15,556	7,169	9,214	11,731	13,275	15,410	15,045	15,226	15,484	16,089	16,563	16,668	16,709	16,862	16,823	17,716
Mississippi	501	1,664	3,094	5,356	8,436	8,623	8,685	8,926	9,129	9,380	9,467	9,680	10,071	10,303	11,065	3,973	6,423	7,302	9,480	11,435	11,356	11,250	11,384	11,560	11,798	11,692	11,917	12,003	12,601
Missouri	709	1,936	4,507	6,764	10,348	10,370	10,555	10,764	11,079	11,233	11,527	11,962	12,305	12,293	13,461	5,621	7,474	10,637	11,974	14,026	13,656	13,672	13,729	14,029	14,129	14,236	14,447	14,560	14,322	15,330
Montana	782	2,476	4,736	6,990	11,599	11,290	11,493	11,840	11,999	12,379	12,489	12,743	13,068	13,221	14,002	6,203	9,560	11,179	12,374	15,722	14,868	14,887	15,101	15,193	15,569	15,424	15,391	15,463	15,403	15,946
Nebraska	736	2,150	4,842	7,360	12,324	12,114	12,374	12,502	12,825	13,700	14,062	14,426	14,246	14,456	15,527	5,842	8,299	11,427	13,028	16,705	15,953	16,029	15,946	16,239	17,231	17,367	17,424	16,857	16,842	17,682
Nevada	769	2,088	4,117	6,148	9,035	8,677	8,525	8,734	8,939	9,233	9,620	9,521	9,776	10,097	10,945	6,104	8,061	9,717	10,883	12,247	11,427	11,043	11,140	11,319	11,613	11,881	11,500	11,567	11,763	12,465
New Hampshire	723	1,916	5,304	7,082	13,964	14,215	14,463	15,013	15,380	15,934	16,360	16,977	17,491	17,817	19,189	5,736	7,396	12,518	12,538	18,928	18,720	18,735	19,148	19,474	20,041	20,205	20,505	20,697	20,757	21,853
New Jersey	1,016	3,191	8,139	10,903	17,654	18,197	19,020	19,282	19,296	20,055	20,735	21,473	22,505	22,434	24,145	8,062	12,320	19,210	19,300	23,930	23,965	24,638	24,594	24,433	25,224	25,608	25,936	26,629	26,137	27,497
New Mexico	707	2,034	3,515	5,835	9,356	9,069	9,230	9,546	9,891	9,954	9,978	10,005	10,543	11,911	11,746	5,609	7,851	8,296	10,329	12,682	11,943	11,957	12,176	12,524	12,520	12,323	12,084	12,475	13,877	13,377
New York	1,327	3,462	8,062	10,957	20,517	20,881	21,172	22,048	22,771	23,678	24,480	25,415	26,727	26,994	28,535	10,526	13,365	19,027	19,396	27,810	27,499	27,426	28,121	28,834	29,780	30,234	30,696	31,625	31,450	32,497
North Carolina	612	1,754	4,290	6,505	8,943	8,828	9,041	8,948	9,245	9,347	9,708	10,039	10,589	10,562	11,620	4,858	6,772	10,126	11,515	12,122	11,626	11,712	11,412	11,707	11,757	11,990	12,125	12,529	12,305	13,233
North Dakota	690	1,920	4,189	6,078	11,356	11,643	12,090	12,952	13,552	14,002	14,443	14,409	14,792	14,966	16,100	5,471	7,413	9,887	10,760	15,393	15,333	15,661	16,519	17,160	17,611	17,838	17,403	17,503	17,436	18,335
Ohio	730	2,075	5,045	7,816	12,484	12,271	12,284	12,447	12,285	12,488	13,019	13,403	14,021	14,198	14,821	5,791	8,009	11,906	13,837	16,922	16,160	15,913	15,875	15,556	15,706	16,079	16,189	16,591	16,542	16,879
Oklahoma	604	1,926	3,508	5,770	8,165	8,281	8,450	8,526	8,633	8,624	8,469	8,769	9,828	10,013	10,823	4,796	7,437	8,279	10,214	11,068	10,906	10,946	10,874	10,931	10,847	10,459	10,591	11,629	11,666	12,326
Oregon	925	2,692	5,474	8,129	10,497	10,386	10,370	10,739	11,356	11,856	12,320	13,066	13,685	13,935	15,697	7,336	10,391	12,920	14,390	14,229	13,678	13,433	13,697	14,379	14,911	15,215	15,781	16,193	16,235	17,876
Pennsylvania	882	2,535	6,228	8,380	14,072	13,973	14,378	14,789	15,405	15,997	16,828	17,465	18,076	18,363	19,251	6,995	9,785	14,699	14,835	19,075	18,402	18,625	18,862	19,506	20,121	20,783	21,094	21,388	21,393	21,924
Rhode Island	891	2,601	6,368	9,646	16,346	16,498	16,187	16,702	17,151	17,332	17,929	18,256	18,981	19,168	20,970	7,070	10,041	15,029	17,076	22,157	21,726	20,968	21,302	21,717	21,799	22,143	22,049	22,459	22,331	23,881
South Carolina	613	1,752	4,082	6,545	9,735	9,823	10,200	10,408	10,670	10,910	11,312	11,953	12,197	12,389	13,098	4,859	6,763	9,634	11,587	13,196	12,936	13,213	13,275	13,511	13,722	13,971	14,437	14,432	14,434	14,916
South Dakota	690	1,908	3,731	6,037	9,431	9,095	9,138	9,539	9,637	9,897	10,905	10,940	11,453	11,151	11,969	5,473	7,364	8,806	10,686	12,784	11,978	11,836	12,166	12,202	12,448	13,468	13,213	13,553	12,992	13,631
Tennessee	566	1,635	3,664	5,837	9,146	9,235	9,370	9,431	9,549	9,719	10,106	10,462	10,885	10,788	10,946	4,491	6,313	8,647	10,333	12,397	12,162	12,137	12,029	12,092	12,224	12,481	12,636	12,880	12,568	12,466
Texas	624	1,916	4,150	6,771	9,418	8,862	8,951	9,273	9,789	10,067	10,264	10,416	10,680	11,286	11,888	4,952	7,395	9,796	11,987	12,767	11,671	11,595	11,827	12,395	12,662	12,677	12,580	12,638	13,149	13,538
Utah	626	1,657	2,764	4,692	6,851	6,787	7,023	7,156	7,375	7,659	7,892	8,315	8,751	9,026	9,783	4,968	6,395	6,523	8,307	9,286	8,938	9,097	9,127	9,338	9,633	9,746	10,043	10,355	10,516	11,141
Vermont	807	1,997	6,227	8,799	16,661	17,575	18,372	19,032	19,793	20,196	20,540	21,706	23,031	24,203	27,427	6,404	7,709	14,696	15,577	22,584	23,145	23,798	24,274	25,063	25,402	25,368	26,216	27,251	28,197	31,235
Virginia	708	1,970	4,672	6,491	11,123	11,385	11,748	11,716	11,810	12,022	12,535	12,784	13,203	13,552	14,659	5,615	7,605	11,026	11,491	15,077	14,993	15,218	14,944	14,954	15,120	15,480	15,441	15,623	15,788	16,694
Washington	915	2,568	4,702	6,914	10,402	10,413	10,553	11,199	11,648	12,533	13,099	14,212	15,831	16,174	17,165	7,262	9,914	11,998	12,239	14,101	13,713	13,670	14,284	14,749	15,763	16,178	17,165	18,732	18,843	19,548
West Virginia	670	1,920	4,360	7,637	12,505	11,982	11,665	11,800	12,414	12,299	12,649	12,620	13,324	13,672	14,237	5,315	7,413	10,292	13,519	16,950	15,779	15,111	15,050	15,718	15,469	15,622	15,243	15,765	15,929	16,214
Wisconsin	883	2,477	5,524	8,299	12,515	11,750	11,768	11,963	12,227	12,312	12,866	13,163	13,527	13,750	15,149	7,003	9,561	13,037	14,690	16,965	15,474	15,244	15,258	15,482	15,485	15,890	15,898	16,006	16,019	17,253
Wyoming	856	2,527	5,577	7,944	17,126	17,228	17,135	17,165	17,445	17,796	17,950	17,736	17,919	18,016	20,129	6,791	9,754	13,164	14,063	23,215	22,688	22,196	21,893	22,089	22,383	22,169	21,421	21,203	20,989	22,923
Other jurisdictions																														
American Samoa	---	---	1,908	2,807	4,877	5,154	4,870	5,504	5,120	5,235	5,622	5,146	5,393	5,594	5,510	---	---	4,502	4,969	6,611	6,788	6,308	7,020	6,484	6,584	6,944	6,216	6,381	6,517	6,275
Guam	820	---	4,234	---	9,280	10,112	9,421	9,914	10,120	9,983	9,939	10,201	9,885	11,227	13,251	6,503	---	9,994	---	12,580	13,317	12,217	12,645	12,815	12,556	12,275	12,321	11,696	13,081	15,091

Table 226.20. SAT mean scores of college-bound seniors, by sex: 1966-67 through 2015-16

	SAT[1]									Scholastic Aptitude Test (old scale)					
	Critical reading score			Mathematics score			Writing score[2]			Verbal score			Mathematics score		
School year	Total	Male	Female	Total	Male	Female	Total	Male	Female	Total	Male	Female	Total	Male	Female
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16
1966-67	543	540	545	516	535	495	†	†	†	466	463	468	492	514	467
1967-68	543	541	543	516	533	497	†	†	†	466	464	466	492	512	470
1968-69	540	536	543	517	534	498	†	†	†	463	459	466	493	513	470
1969-70	537	536	538	512	531	493	†	†	†	460	459	461	488	509	465
1970-71	532	531	534	513	529	494	†	†	†	455	454	457	488	507	466
1971-72	530	531	529	509	527	489	†	†	†	453	454	452	484	505	461
1972-73	523	523	521	506	525	489	†	†	†	445	446	443	481	502	460
1973-74	521	524	520	505	524	488	†	†	†	444	447	442	480	501	459
1974-75	512	515	509	498	518	479	†	†	†	434	437	431	472	495	449
1975-76	509	511	508	497	520	475	†	†	†	431	433	430	472	497	446
1976-77	507	509	505	496	520	474	†	†	†	429	431	427	470	497	445
1977-78	507	511	503	494	517	474	†	†	†	429	433	425	468	494	444
1978-79	505	509	501	493	516	473	†	†	†	427	431	423	467	493	443
1979-80	502	506	498	492	515	473	†	†	†	424	428	420	466	491	443
1980-81	502	508	496	492	516	473	†	†	†	424	430	418	466	492	443
1981-82	504	509	499	493	516	473	†	†	†	426	431	421	467	493	443
1982-83	503	508	498	494	516	474	†	†	†	425	430	420	468	493	445
1983-84	504	511	498	497	518	478	†	†	†	426	433	420	471	495	449
1984-85	509	514	503	500	522	480	†	†	†	431	437	425	475	499	452
1985-86	509	515	504	500	523	479	†	†	†	431	437	426	475	501	451
1986-87	507	512	502	501	523	481	†	†	†	430	435	425	476	500	453
1987-88	505	512	499	501	521	483	†	†	†	428	435	422	476	498	455
1988-89	504	510	498	502	523	482	†	†	†	427	434	421	476	500	454
1989-90	500	505	496	501	521	483	†	†	†	424	429	419	476	499	455
1990-91	499	503	495	500	520	482	†	†	†	422	426	418	474	497	453
1991-92	500	504	496	501	521	484	†	†	†	423	428	419	476	499	456
1992-93	500	504	497	503	524	484	†	†	†	424	428	420	478	502	457
1993-94	499	501	497	504	523	487	†	†	†	423	425	421	479	501	460
1994-95	504	505	502	506	525	490	†	†	†	428	429	426	482	503	463
1995-96	505	507	503	508	527	492	†	†	†	—	—	—	—	—	—
1996-97	505	507	503	511	530	494	†	†	†	—	—	—	—	—	—
1997-98	505	509	502	512	531	496	†	†	†	—	—	—	—	—	—
1998-99	505	509	502	511	531	495	†	†	†	—	—	—	—	—	—
1999-2000	505	507	504	514	533	498	†	†	†	†	†	†	†	†	†
2000-01	506	509	502	514	533	498	†	†	†	†	†	†	†	†	†
2001-02	504	507	502	516	534	500	†	†	†	†	†	†	†	†	†
2002-03	507	512	503	519	537	503	†	†	†	†	†	†	†	†	†
2003-04	508	512	504	518	537	501	†	†	†	†	†	†	†	†	†
2004-05	508	513	505	520	538	504	†	†	†	†	†	†	†	†	†
2005-06	503	505	502	518	536	502	497	491	502	†	†	†	†	†	†
2006-07	502	504	502	515	533	499	494	489	500	†	†	†	†	†	†
2007-08	502	504	500	515	533	500	494	488	501	†	†	†	†	†	†
2008-09	501	503	498	515	534	499	493	486	499	†	†	†	†	†	†
2009-10	501	503	498	516	534	500	492	486	498	†	†	†	†	†	†
2010-11	497	500	495	514	531	500	489	482	496	†	†	†	†	†	†
2011-12	496	498	493	514	532	499	488	481	494	†	†	†	†	†	†
2012-13	496	499	494	514	531	499	488	482	493	†	†	†	†	†	†
2013-14	497	499	495	513	530	499	487	481	492	†	†	†	†	†	†
2014-15	495	497	493	511	527	496	484	478	490	†	†	†	†	†	†
2015-16[3]	494	495	493	508	524	494	482	475	487	†	†	†	†	†	†

—Not available.

†Not applicable.

[1] Data for 1966-67 to 1985-86 were converted to the recentered scale by using a formula applied to the original mean and standard deviation. For 1986-87 to 1994-95, individual student scores were converted to the recentered scale and then the mean was recomputed. For 1995-96 to 1998-99, nearly all students received scores on the recentered scale; any score on the original scale was converted to the recentered scale prior to recomputing the mean. From 1999-2000 on, all scores have been reported on the recentered scale.

[2] The SAT writing section was introduced in March 2005.